Measuring Scholarly Impact
Are Citation Metrics the Right Fit for Law Schools?
HeinOnline, Author Profiles, & ScholarCheck Metrics

Shane Marmion, William S. Hein & Company
• HeinOnline Scholar Check & Author Profiles Overview
• U.S. News & World Report
• Quality Control and Enhancements
About Author Profiles & Scholar Check

For any author represented in the Law Journal Library, Author Profile Pages automatically display a list of articles and ScholarCheck statistics. A profile page can be enhanced by including the following information:

- Photo
- University/Affiliation
- Title
- ORCID ID
- Biography
- Link to affiliation webpage
- Social Media Links
Enhance Author Profile Pages

Users can edit or enhance a profile by clicking on Edit Author Profile within the author profile page. All edits are verified by HeinOnline Support before changes go live. There is also a web form located at: https://home.heinonline.org/author-portal/
About Author Profiles & Scholar Check

For any author represented in the Law Journal Library, Author Profile Pages automatically display a list of articles and ScholarCheck statistics. The existing profile can be enhanced to include a photo, biographical information, and links to the author’s website and social media accounts.

ScholarCheck metrics include:

1. Cited by Cases
2. Cited by Articles
3. Accessed (Rolling 12 month period)
4. Cited by Articles (Past 10 years)
5. Cited by Articles (Previous Year + YTD)
About Author Profiles & Scholar Check

Additional metrics not factored into an author’s overall ScholarCheck ranking analysis include:

**Average Citations per Article**
This metric counts the cumulative number of times this author has been cited by other articles, then divides this number by this author’s total number of articles written to calculate the average number of citations per article.

**Average Citations per Document**
This metric counts the cumulative number of times this author has been cited by other articles, then divides this number by this author’s total number of documents written to calculate the average number of citations per document.

**Self-Citations**
This metric counts the cumulative number of an author’s self-citations.

**H-Index**
The h-index is an author-level metric that attempts to measure both the productivity and citation impact of an author’s publications. The index is based on the set of the author’s most cited papers and the number of citations that they have received in other publications.
Scholar Check Coverage

**Periodical Coverage**
- Law Journal Library
- Bar Journals
- ALI-CLE Journals
- Kluwer Law International Database
- Foreign & International Law Resources: Yearbooks and Periodicals
- ABA Law Library Periodical Database

**Case Law Coverage**
- All Federal Circuit Courts
- All Federal District Courts
- All Federal Bankruptcy Courts
- U.S. Supreme Court
- All 50 State Courts
- Specialty Courts

*Indexed only and all embargoed content are included in the citation analysis.*
ScholarRank

ScholarCheck Rank, or ScholarRank, is an overall ranking based primarily on the five HeinOnline ScholarCheck metrics. The five metrics are:

1. Cited by Cases
2. Cited by Articles
3. Accessed (Past 12 Months)
4. Cited by Articles (Past 10 Years)
5. Cited by Articles (Past 1-2 years)

h-index is also used as a modifier in overall scholar check rank to reduce ties.

ScholarCheck Score = (total of all 5 scholarcheck metrics rankings/5) – (h-index/1000)

(The totals for each of the five metrics are ranked using dense ranking.)

Next, the scores are sorted from lowest to highest and ranked using standard competition ranking. The lowest score will have a ScholarRank of 1. The ranking encompasses ALL authors indexed in HeinOnline.
Access and Download Metrics

Users have the ability to download a CSV of ScholarCheck metrics for an entire institution. To utilize this feature, navigate to the Law Journal Library and Browse by Author Profiles.
Access and Download Metrics

When users click on the institution's name, all articling authors who have enhanced their Author Profile will be provided, as well as a link to download a CSV of ScholarCheck metrics for all of the enhanced profiles from the institution. A CSV is automatically downloaded when the user clicks on the link. All of the authors’ information is pulled into the CSV, where a user can sort/filter the information by any individual metric or by overall ScholarCheck rank.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author Profiles by Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Columbia University School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• CSV for this institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barnesberg, Mark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berges, Vivian O.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bertram, George A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhagwat, Jagdish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black, Barbara Aaronstein</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black, Charles L. Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blasi, Vincent Anthony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bobbitt, Philip C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bollinger, Lee C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bradford, Anu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Briffault, Richard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulman-Pozar, Jessica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carter, Alexandra B.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland, Sarah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coffee, John C. Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crenshaw, Kimberle Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darnosch, Lori Fisher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dignam, Brett</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doyle, Michael</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edgar, Harold S.H.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emens, Elizabeth Francis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farnsworth, E. Allan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fletcher, George P.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fox, Merritt B.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author Names</th>
<th>Total Number of Articles</th>
<th>Cited By Cases</th>
<th>Cited By Cases Rank</th>
<th>Cited By Articles</th>
<th>Cited By Articles Rank</th>
<th>Accessed (Past 12 Months)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>1,414</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>827</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>724</td>
<td>1,079</td>
<td>900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>1,545</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1,612</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,698</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,838</td>
<td>359</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>252</td>
<td>1,448</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1,655</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>1,508</td>
<td>571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2,865</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>1,674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>252</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>639</td>
<td>1,064</td>
<td>658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1,700</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>817</td>
<td>907</td>
<td>544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9,702</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4,729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3,581</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>17,701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,898</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,099</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
HeinOnline users can set up email alerts regarding a designated author’s works. Simply click on the Set up email alerts icon found on the author’s profile page.

The four different alerts are for:

- When new articles for this author is added to HeinOnline
- When new articles in HeinOnline cite this author’s articles
- When articles are accessed on HeinOnline each month
- When similar articles are published on this author’s works

Choose the desired alerts, enter an email address, and click Set up email alerts. These alerts will be sent once a month.
Author Profiles & Explore This Author

Whisner, Mary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Full Name</th>
<th>Whisner, Mary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University/Affiliation</td>
<td>University of Washington School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Research Services Librarian</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Article Topics:
- Research (27)
- Legal Research (19)
- Libraries (16)
- Legal Analysis and Writing (9)
- Students (9)
- Technology (8)
- Government (6)
- History (5)
- Law Students (6)
- Science and Technology (6)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>#</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cited by Cases</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cited by Articles</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>1,546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessed (Past 12 Months)</td>
<td>1,188</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cited by Articles (Past 10 Years)</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cited by Articles (Previous Year + YTD)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ScholarCheck Rank</td>
<td>1,851</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Citations per Article</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Citations per Document</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Citations</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-Index</td>
<td>6.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Author Profiles & Explore This Author

Whisner, Mary

Full Name: Whisner, Mary
University/Affiliation: University of Washington School of Law
Title: Research Services Librarian

Related Authors:
- Lutcher, Richard A.
  University of Nebraska College of Law (Scholar Rank #27,725)
- Hazelton, Penny A.
  (Scholar Rank #55,867)
- Simons, Spencer L.
  (Scholar Rank #80,959)
- Peoples, Lee F.
  Oklahoma City University School of Law (Scholar Rank #9,025)
- Davidson, Stephanie
  (Scholar Rank #41,344)
- Denner, Richard A.
  Duke University School of Law (Scholar Rank #5,016)
- Torres, Arturo
  Texas Tech University School of Law (Scholar Rank #16,042)
- Bering, Robert C.
  (Scholar Rank #6,193)
- Barian, Steven M.
  University of Wisconsin Law School (Scholar Rank #14,343)
- Shapiro, Fred R.
  Yale Law School (Scholar Rank #1,272)
Why Hein?

Prior to the February 2019 announcement, the Hein Company was approached by a group of law school deans and professors who requested that we consider collaborating with *U.S. News* on this upcoming project. HeinOnline was chosen by the group and *U.S. News* based on the following qualifications:

- HeinOnline’s Law Journal Library contains comprehensive coverage of more nearly 2,800 legal periodicals, more than its current competitors.

- HeinOnline had already created its own tools for citation analysis within ScholarCheck.

- HeinOnline had already begun performing citation analyses of faculty publications using these tools.

- Hein’s citations offer many advantages over other database providers such as: including indexing multiple authors per article, more foreign law journals, comprehensive coverage, and several others.
Law Journal Library

- It contains nearly 2,800 journals, 65,000 volumes, and more than 2 million documents within 37 million pages.

- HeinOnline contains 98% of the Top 500 Journals and 85% of the Top 1,000 Journals according to the Washington and Lee Law Journal Rankings Project.

- Out of the 2,800 journals, all date back to inception and more than 2,200 include coverage to most current issue, with no delay.

- There are currently 1,750 active serial titles, and nearly 40% of the journals or over 1,000 journals are published outside of the U.S.

- Interdisciplinary: Comprised of a variety of subjects such as political science, technology, history, and much more!
Overview of HeinOnline’s Law Journal Library

The Law Journal Library contains many non-academic and commercial journals, from publishers such as:

- American Bar Association
- American Society of International Law
- Brill Publishers
- Cambridge University Press
- Canadian Bar Association
- Clarus Press
- De Gruyter
- Edward Elgar Publishing
- Hart Publishing
- Institute of Art & Law
- McGill Institute of Air and Space Law
- Oxford University Press
- Paris Legal Publishers
- SAGE Publishers
- Taylor & Francis
- Vathek Publishing
- John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Wolters Kluwer
Interdisciplinary Journals

The Law Journal Library contains hundreds of interdisciplinary journals that cover a vast number of subjects, including:

- Business/Economics
- Communications
- Criminal Justice
- Environmental & Conservation Law
- Family Law
- Health and Safety
- Human Rights
- Intellectual Property
- International Relations
- Immigration
- Medical Jurisprudence
- Political Science
- Psychology/Sociology
- Religion/Theology
- Taxation
- Technology/Computers
- Terrorism
- Women’s Studies
Interdisciplinary Journals in HeinOnline (Sample)

- American Journal of Jurisprudence
- American Journal of Law & Medicine
- American Journal of Mediation
- American Law and Economics Review
- American Political Science Review
- Annals of Health Law
- Arbitration International
- Asian Journal of Law and Economics
- Australian Journal of Legal Philosophy
- Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice
- Canadian Journal of Law and Society
- Cato Supreme Court Review
- Clearinghouse Review
- Columbia Journal of Law & the Arts
- Conflict Resolution Quarterly
- Criminal Justice
- Criminal Justice and Behavior
- Criminal Justice Ethics
- Criminal Justice Policy Review
- Criminal Justice Review
- Criminology
- Criminology & Public Policy
- Criminology, Criminal Justice, Law & Society
- Employee Rights and Employment Policy Journal
- European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice
- European Journal of Criminology
- European Journal of Social Security
- Federal Probation
- Health Economics, Policy and Law
- Health Matrix: Journal of Law-Medicine
- Holy Cross Journal of Law and Public Policy
- Human Rights Quarterly
- International Commentary on Evidence
- International Journal of Cultural Property
- International Journal of Law in Context
- International Journal of Police Science and Management
- International Review of the Red Cross
- International Tax Journal
- International Theory: A Journal of International Politics, Law and Philosophy
- Islamic Law and Society
- Journal of Affordable Housing and Community Development Law
- Journal of Australian Taxation
- Journal of Church and State
- Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology
- Journal of Empirical Legal Studies
- Journal of Ethics & Social Philosophy
- Journal of Gender, Race & Justice
- Journal of Human Rights
- Journal of Human Rights and the Environment
- Journal of International Criminal Justice
- Journal of Law and Religion
- Journal of Law and Society
- Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics
- Journal of Legal Medicine
- Journal of State Taxation
- Journal of Supreme Court History
- Labor Law Journal
- Law and Contemporary Problems
- Law and Psychology Review
- Legal Studies
- Legal Theory
- Medico-Legal Journal
- Middle East Law and Governance
- Muslim World Journal of Human Rights
- Negotiation Journal
- Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights
- PoLAR: Political and Legal Anthropology Review
- Police Journal
- Police Quarterly
- Prison Journal
- Psychiatry, Psychology and Law
- Public Interest Law Reporter
- Ratio Juris: An International Journal of Jurisprudence and Philosophy of Law
- Review of Constitutional Studies
- Social & Legal Studies
- South African Journal of Criminal Justice
- South African Journal on Human Rights
- Southern California Interdisciplinary Law Journal
- Southern Journal of Policy and Justice
- Taxes - The Tax Magazine
- Theoretical Inquiries in Law
- Transnational Legal Theory
- Women’s Rights Law Reporter
- World Trade Review
How Hein Is Involved

Our role in this project is to provide *U.S. News* with the citation metrics from HeinOnline. As for the methodology that will be used for their analysis, we will not be involved. The Hein company is not receiving any type of compensation for its work on this project; we simply felt that if *U.S. News* was going to proceed with such an analysis, HeinOnline would be a good source for the law review citation analysis.
U.S. News & World Report Project – Phase 1

Data Gathering & Quality Control Process

1. Obtain Faculty List by Law School
   • US News & World Report Survey
   • AALS Directory
2. Associate Faculty List with HeinOnline Author Index
3. Author Name Disambiguation
4. Author Indexing Cleanup
5. Review & Assistance from law school library staff and faculty
6. Adjustments & Corrections
Phase 1 – Name Disambiguation

Combining Author Name Variations

Example #1 – Author with articles published under 5 different names. The HeinOnline author index would treat as 5 different authors if not combined:

1. Lietzan, Erika
2. Lietzan, Erika King
3. Lietzan, Erika Fisher
4. King, Erika F.
5. King, Erika
Phase 1 – Name Disambiguation

Example #2

This submitted faculty roster did not include all name variations. Hein’s data team will review all possible variations found in HeinOnline.

Two corrections found during our QC:

1. Author name published as ‘Miller, Elizabeth Stone’. Stone as middle name not provided as a name variation but picked up via Similar Author tool and confirmed by QC’er
2. Indexing error – Eliabeth (no z in first name)
Phase 1 – Indexing Errors

**Example #3**
Indexing error where associated article has relevant citation metrics which will improve the author’s overall citations.
Phase 1 – Quality Control Overview

Hein compiled a data team to review each faculty member included on the XLS to make sure they’re properly associated with the HeinOnline-indexed data. Part of the review from the data team included reviewing any/all similar author names which could potentially include indexing errors. Identified indexing errors have been corrected and known name variations combined to help associate the proper works with each faculty member.

While our quality assurance check is effective, the challenge of properly disambiguating all proper name variations is very difficult, especially in the cases of common names. We asked each school to review their faculty members’ profile pages in HeinOnline and notify us of any discrepancies which they were able to find.

We contacted the person who submitted the original faculty XLS to US News as well as the Library Director (and anyone else who requested to receive notification). Included in the confirmation message from Hein was a summary of the work we have done as well as the XLS of faculty names which were included in the US News Survey submission that will also include the HeinOnline Author Profile page URL.

The overall process has taken over 1,000 hours of labor in compiling and reviewing nearly 7,000 faculty profile page.
Phase 2 – Citation Counts

Citation Metrics (July 2019)

There are currently over **7.5 million** article to article citations in HeinOnline.

There are currently over **300,000** case to article citations.

ScholarCheck looks at citation patterns in the text using sources such as:

- Bluebook
- Prince’s Bieber Dictionary of Legal Abbreviations
- Cardiff Index to Legal Abbreviations
- McGill Citation Guide
- And many others!
Phase 2 – Citation Counts

ScholarCheck and Citation Metrics: Example


Simplified Pleading, Meaningful Days in Court, and Trials on the Merits: Reflections on the Deformation of Federal Procedure [article]
Miller, Arthur R. (Cited 2436 times)


- NYUL Rev
- N.Y.U.L.R.
- N.Y.L.

- N.Y. Univ. L. Rev.
- New York University Law Review
- NYU L Rev
- NYU L. Rev.
Citation Counts

Hein is aware that the use of citation pattern matching is not a perfect method for counting citations for many reasons such as OCR errors, proper citation rules not followed, etc...

Does a perfect method exist? Likely not

Our goal is to continue to enhance our methods for counting citations so that we can provide the best possible results

Our development team has been experimenting with other methods to count citations such as searches by author name, as well as article title (and variants) to ensure completeness.

This method showed too large a % of false positives
Improvements made to citation counts

1. Name Disambiguation
2. Author name indexing error cleanup
3. OCR correction (i.e. “Pitr L. Rev.” = “Pitt. L. Rev”)
4. Addition of common citations used not currently included in HeinOnline metadata
5. Ability to add missed citations:
   • Current process is manual
   • Tool in interface to submit corrections in development
6. ORCID
7. Author Administration Portal for Librarian’s
Future Initiatives

1. Licensing additional content:
   • 10-15 new journals added monthly
   • More interdisciplinary journals

2. Counting citations beyond periodical coverage
   • i.e. ALI Restatements
   • Books, Treatises, etc..
   • West Academic Casebook Collection
     (forthcoming)

3. Tools to enhance citation tracking methods
   • ORCID & DOI’s
   • Author Admin Portal
   • OCR & “Crowdsourcing” tools
In conclusion

This project has been a major undertaking, but we are committed to improving our data so that we can provide the most accurate results possible. Our mission remains to be first amongst equals and offer the best scholarly legal database to our customers, knowing that enhancing ScholarCheck and adding more analytics will improve the HeinOnline research experience. We appreciate all of the questions, comments, and concerns that we have received thus far.