

The Law of the International Criminal Court

Second edition

YOUNG SOK KIM

*Professor of Law
Ewha Womans University
School of Law, Seoul, South Korea*

William S. Hein & Co., Inc.
Getzville, New York
2019

Summary of Contents

Foreword [to the First Edition] / xvii

Preface to the Second Edition / xix

Preface [to the First Edition] / xxi

CHAPTER 1	Introduction / 1
CHAPTER 2	Establishment of the Court / 23
CHAPTER 3	Crimes within the Jurisdiction of the ICC / 31
CHAPTER 4	Jurisdictional Regime of the Court / 141
CHAPTER 5	General Principles of Criminal Law / 199
CHAPTER 6	Composition and Administration of the Court / 227
CHAPTER 7	Investigation and Prosecution / 255
CHAPTER 8	The Trial / 277
CHAPTER 9	Penalties / 309
CHAPTER 10	Appeal and Revision / 317
CHAPTER 11	International Cooperation and Judicial Assistance / 327
CHAPTER 12	Enforcement / 375
CHAPTER 13	Assembly of States Parties and Financing / 387
CHAPTER 14	Final Clauses / 397
CHAPTER 15	Conclusion / 409

Annex: Elements of Crime / 413

Annex: Rules of Procedure and Evidence / 447

Index / 519

Table of Contents

Foreword [to the First Edition].....	xvii
Preface to the Second Edition	xix
Preface [to the First Edition]	xxi
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
I. The Adoption of the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court and Creation of the Court.....	1
A. The Adoption of the Rome Statute of the ICC	1
B. The Negotiating Process of the Rome Conference.....	2
II. A Historical Perspective on the Establishment of the International Criminal Court.....	4
A. International Criminal Courts before World War II.....	4
B. International Criminal Courts after World War II.....	5
III. The Necessity of an Effective Permanent International Criminal Court	12
A. To End Impunity.....	12
B. To Deter the Crimes of International Concern.....	12
C. To Afford Redress.....	13
D. To Counter the Failure of National Systems.....	13
E. To Remedy the Limitations of Ad Hoc Tribunals	13
F. To Provide an Enforcement Mechanism.....	13
G. To Serve as a Model.....	13
IV. A Brief Review of the Contents of the Rome Statute.....	14
A. The Structure and Principles of the Statute.....	14
B. Preamble	14
C. Part 1—Establishment of the Court	14
D. Part 2—Jurisdiction, Admissibility and Applicable Law	14
E. Part 3—General Principles of Criminal Law	15
F. Part 4—Composition and Administration of the Court.....	16
G. Part 5—Investigation and Prosecution.....	16
H. Part 6—The Trial.....	16
I. Part 7—Penalties.....	17
J. Part 8—Appeal and Revision.....	17
K. Part 9—International Cooperation and Judicial Assistance	17
L. Part 10—Enforcement.....	18
M. Part 11—Assembly of States Parties.....	18
N. Part 12—Financing	18
O. Part 13—Final Clauses.....	19
V. The Position of the United States on the Rome Statute	19
VI. The Importance of the Preparatory Commission.....	20
VII. Conclusion.....	21
Chapter 2 Establishment of the Court.....	23
I. Principles under the Preamble of the Statute.....	23
II. The Court as a Treaty Body (Article 1)	26
III. Relationship of the Court with the United Nations (Article 2).....	27
IV. Seat of the Court and the Headquarters Agreement (Article 3).....	28
V. Legal Status and Powers of the Court (Article 4)	28

Chapter 3 Crimes within the Jurisdiction of the ICC	31
I. Crimes within the Jurisdiction of the Court (Article 5)	31
II. The Crime of Aggression	32
A. Introduction.....	32
B. The Outlawry of War before World War II.....	32
C. The Outlawry of War after World War II.....	34
D. The Crime of Aggression under the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court.....	38
E. Discussions at the Special Working Group on the Crime of Aggression (SWGCA).....	45
F. Kampala Agreement on the Crime of Aggression.....	46
G. Activation of the ICC’s Jurisdiction over the Crime of Aggression.....	53
III. The Crime of Genocide (Article 6)	58
A. Introduction.....	59
B. Analysis of Elements.....	60
C. Discussions on the Crime of Genocide at the Preparatory Commission.....	62
D. Gaps and Ambiguities of Genocide and <i>Jus Cogens</i>	63
IV. Crimes against Humanity (Article 7)	64
A. Introduction.....	65
B. Chapeau Elements of Crimes against Humanity.....	65
C. Underlying Offences.....	70
D. The Inclusion of Article 7, Paragraph 2 of the Statute.....	79
E. The Inclusion of Article 7, Paragraph 3 of the Statute.....	80
V. War Crimes (Article 8)	80
A. Introduction.....	83
B. International Armed Conflict v. Non-International Armed Conflict.....	84
C. Paragraph 1: The Threshold of War Crimes—“In particular” or “only”.....	85
D. Paragraph 2(a): Grave Breaches of Geneva Conventions.....	87
E. Paragraph 2(b): Other Serious Violations of the Laws and Customs Applicable in International Armed Conflict.....	91
F. Paragraph 2(c), (d), (e) and (f): Non-International Armed Conflict.....	121
G. Article 8, paragraph 2(e) and (f): Other serious violations of the laws and customs applicable in armed conflicts not of an international character.....	127
H. The Inclusion of Article 8, Paragraph 3.....	133
I. Conclusion.....	133
J. Amendments to Article 8.....	133
VI. Elements of Crimes (Article 9) and Customary International Law (Article 10)	137
A. Elements of Crimes.....	137
B. Article 10 of the Statute.....	139
Chapter 4 Jurisdictional Regime of the Court	141
I. Introduction	141
II. Jurisdiction Ratione Temporis (Temporal Jurisdiction, Article 11)	141
III. The Preconditions to the Exercise of the Jurisdiction of the Court (Article 12)	143
A. Introduction.....	143
B. The Trigger Mechanism of the International Criminal Court and the Necessity of the Precondition.....	144
C. The Proposals on the Precondition to the Jurisdiction of the International Criminal Court.....	145
D. Article 12 of the Rome Statute and the Position of the United States.....	158
E. Article 12, the Law of Treaties, and Customary International Law.....	160
F. Conclusion—The Reasons Why Article 12 Does Not Violate the Law of Treaties.....	166
G. Declaration Provided For in Article 12(3) of the Statute.....	168

IV. Exercise of Jurisdiction (Trigger Mechanism, Article 13)	169
A. Introduction	169
B. The Draft Statute	170
C. The Discussion Paper	171
D. The Bureau Proposal	172
E. Article 13 of the Statute	172
V. Referral of a Situation by a State Party (Article 14)	173
A. The Draft Statute	173
B. The Discussion Paper and the Bureau Proposal	174
C. Article 14 of the Statute	174
VI. Prosecutor (Article 15)	175
A. The Draft Statute	175
B. The Discussion Paper and the Bureau Proposal	176
C. The Bureau Proposal	177
D. Article 15 of the Statute	178
VII. Deferral of Investigation or Prosecution (Article 16)	179
A. Role of the Security Council	179
B. The Referral of a Situation Other Than Aggression	179
C. The Referral of the Act of Aggression	180
D. Deferral by the Court to the Request of the Security Council	180
VIII. Issues of Admissibility (The Principle of Complementarity, Article 17)	183
A. The Primacy to National Jurisdictions	183
B. The Criteria of Unwillingness	184
C. The Criteria of Inability	184
D. Conclusion	184
IX. Preliminary Rulings Regarding Admissibility (Article 18)	186
A. Procedure under Article 18	187
B. An Evaluation	188
X. Challenges to the Jurisdiction of the Court or the Admissibility of a Case (Article 19)	189
A. Challenges to the ICC Jurisdiction and Admissibility	190
B. Who Can Challenge?	190
C. The Right of the Prosecutor	191
D. The Challenge Procedure	191
E. The Effect of the Challenge	192
F. Requests by the Prosecutor	193
G. An Evaluation	193
XI. Ne Bis in Idem (Article 20)	194
A. Prohibition of Double Jeopardy under Article 20	194
B. Article 19 of the Draft Statute (Parole, Pardons or Amnesties)	195
XII. Applicable Law (Article 21)	196
Chapter 5 General Principles of Criminal Law	199
I. Introduction	199
II. Nullum Crimen Sine Lege, Nulla Poena Sine Lege (Articles 22 and 23)	199
A. A Brief Legislative History on Articles 22 and 23	199
B. The Principle of Legality	200
III. Non-Retroactivity Ratione Personae (Article 24)	201
A. Article 24 of the Statute	201
B. The Principle of Non-Retroactivity	202

IV. Individual Criminal Responsibility (Article 25)	202
A. Natural Person versus Legal Person	203
B. The Nuremberg Principle and Criminal Organization.....	204
C. Individual Criminal Responsibility	205
D. Types of Criminal liability	205
E. State Responsibility	208
V. Exclusion of Jurisdiction over Persons under Eighteen (Article 26)	208
VI. Irrelevance of Official Capacity (Article 27)	209
A. The Draft Statute	209
B. Article 27 of the Statute	209
VII. Responsibility of Commanders and Other Superiors (Article 28)	211
A. Introduction	211
B. Protocol I	212
C. ICTY Statute and ICTR Statute.....	212
D. The Draft Statute	213
E. A Proposal by the United States	213
F. Article 28 of the Statute.....	214
VIII. Non-Applicability of Statute of Limitations (Article 29)	215
IX. Mental Element (Article 30)	216
A. Actus Reus (Act and/or Omission)	216
B. Mens Rea (Mental Elements).....	217
X. Grounds for Excluding Criminal Responsibility (Article 31)	218
A. Introduction	219
B. Paragraph 1(a): Mental Disease or Defect	220
C. Paragraph 1(b): Intoxication.....	220
D. Paragraph 1(c): Self-defense, Defense of Others and Defense of Property	221
E. Paragraph 1(d): Duress	221
F. Paragraph 2: The Applicability of Exculpatory Grounds	222
G. Paragraph 3: Other Grounds for Excluding Criminal Responsibility.....	222
XI. Mistake of Fact or Mistake of Law (Article 32)	222
A. Introduction	223
B. Mistake of Facts	223
C. Mistake of Law.....	223
D. Conclusion.....	224
XII. Superior Orders and Prescription of Law (Article 33)	224
A. History	225
B. Article 33 of the Statute	225
Chapter 6 Composition and Administration of the Court	227
I. Organs of the Court and Service of Judges (Article 34 and Article 35)	227
II. Qualifications, Nomination and Election of Judges (Article 36)	228
A. The Number of Judges	230
B. Qualifications of Judges	230
C. Nomination of Judges and Advisory Committee on Nominations.....	232
D. The Election of Judges	233
E. The Term of Office of Judges	234
III. Judicial Vacancies (Article 37)	234
IV. The Presidency (Article 38)	235

V. Chambers (Article 39)	236
A. Article 39 of the Statute.....	237
B. The Right to Trial by Jury.....	238
VI. Independence of the Judges and Excusing and Disqualification of Judges (Article 40 and Article 41)	238
A. Independence of the Judges (Article 40).....	239
B. Excusing and Disqualification of Judges (Article 41).....	239
VII. The Office of the Prosecutor (Article 42)	241
VIII. The Registry, Staff and Solemn Undertaking (Article 43, Article 44 and Article 45)	244
A. The Registry (Article 43).....	245
B. Staff (Article 44).....	246
C. Solemn Undertaking (Article 45).....	247
IX. Removal from Office and Disciplinary Measures (Article 46 and Article 47)	247
A. Removal from Office (Article 46).....	247
B. Disciplinary Measures (Article 47).....	248
X. Privileges and Immunities, Salaries, Allowances and Expenses (Article 48 and Article 49)	249
A. Privileges and Immunities (Article 48).....	249
B. Salaries, Allowances and Expenses (Article 49).....	251
XI. Official and Working Languages, Rules of Procedure and Evidence and Regulations of the Court (Article 50, Article 51 and Article 52)	251
A. Official and Working Languages (Article 50).....	252
B. Rules of Procedure and Evidence (Article 51).....	252
C. Regulations of the Court (Article 52).....	254
Chapter 7 Investigation and Prosecution	255
I. Introduction	255
II. Initiation of an Investigation (Article 53)	255
III. Duties and Powers of the Prosecutor with Respect to Investigations (Article 54)	258
IV. Rights of Persons during an Investigation (Article 55)	260
V. Role of the Pre-Trial Chamber in Relation to a Unique Investigative Opportunity (Article 56)	262
VI. Functions and Powers of the Pre-Trial Chamber (Article 57)	264
VII. Issuance by the Pre-Trial Chamber of a Warrant of Arrest or a Summons to Appear (Article 58)	266
VIII. Arrest Proceedings in the Custodial State (Article 59)	268
IX. Initial Proceedings before the Court (Article 60)	270
X. Confirmation of the Charges before Trial (Article 61)	271
Chapter 8 The Trial	277
I. Place of Trial (Article 62)	277
II. Trial in the Presence of the Accused (Article 63)	278
III. Functions and Powers of the Trial Chamber (Article 64)	278
IV. Proceedings on an Admission of Guilt (Article 65)	281
V. Presumption of Innocence (Article 66)	283
VI. Rights of the Accused (Article 67)	284
A. General Remarks.....	285
B. Minimum Guarantees.....	285
C. The Disclosure by the Prosecutor.....	287

VII. Protection of the Victims and Witnesses and Their Participation in the Proceedings (Article 68)	288
VIII. Evidence (Article 69)	291
IX. Offences against the Administration of Justice (Article 70)	294
X. Sanctions for Misconduct before the Court (Article 71)	296
XI. Protection of National Security Information (Article 72)	297
XII. Third-Party Information or Documents (Article 73)	301
XIII. Requirements for the Decision (Article 74)	302
XIV. Reparations to Victims (Article 75)	303
XV. Sentencing (Article 76)	306
Chapter 9 Penalties	309
I. Applicable Penalties (Article 77)	309
A. General Remarks	309
B. The Ordinary Penalty Applied by the Court	310
C. The Relation to Article 110 of the Rome Statute	310
D. Death Penalty	311
E. Fine or Forfeiture of Proceeds	312
F. Penalties Applicable to Legal Persons	312
II. Determination of the Sentence (Article 78)	312
III. Trust Fund (Article 79)	313
IV. Non-Prejudice to National Application of Penalties and National Laws (Article 80)	314
Chapter 10 Appeal and Revision	317
I. Introduction	317
II. Appeal against Decision of Acquittal or Conviction or Against Sentence (Article 81)	317
III. Appeal against Other Decisions (Article 82)	319
IV. Proceedings on Appeal (Article 83)	322
V. Revision of Conviction or Sentence (Article 84)	323
VI. Compensation to an Arrested or Convicted Person (Article 85)	324
Chapter 11 International Cooperation and Judicial Assistance	327
I. Introduction	327
II. General Obligation to Cooperate (Article 86)	328
A. “Statute” or “Part”	328
B. [Undue] Delay	328
C. The Extent of the Obligation under Article 86.....	328
III. Requests for Cooperation: General Provisions (Article 87)	330
A. Channel of the Request	331
B. Translations.....	331
C. Confidential Requests.....	331
D. The Protection of Victims or Witnesses.....	332
E. The Invitation of a Non-State Party.....	332
F. The Remedy for the Non-State Party’s Failure to Comply	333
G. The Request to Intergovernmental Organizations.....	333
H. The Remedy for the State Party’s Failure to Comply.....	333

IV. Availability of Procedures under National Law (Article 88)	334
V. Surrender of Persons to the Court (Article 89)	335
A. Use of Terms	335
B. Paragraph 1	336
C. The Challenge before a National Court	337
D. Transit of Surrendered Person.....	337
E. Delayed or Temporary Surrender.....	338
F. Grounds for Refusal of the Surrender of a Person under the Draft Statute.....	339
G. Other Grounds for Refusal of the Surrender of a Person.....	341
H. The Difference between “Surrender” and “Extradition”.....	344
VI. Competing Requests (Article 90)	344
A. General Remarks.....	345
B. The Same Person for the Same Conduct.....	346
C. The Priority of the Request by the Court	346
D. The Extradition Request from the Other State Pending the Determination of the Court	346
E. A Request by a Non-State Party Which Does Not Raise International Obligation	346
F. A Request by a Non-State Party Which Raises International Obligation	347
G. The Same Person for Different Conduct.....	347
H. When the Court Has Determined a Case Inadmissible and Extradition to the Requesting State Is Refused.....	347
VII. Contents of Request for Arrest and Surrender (Article 91)	348
A. General Remarks.....	348
B. The Common Requirement of Contents of Request.....	349
C. In the Case of Pre-Conviction	349
D. In the Case of the Post-Conviction	349
E. The Obligation of a State Party to Advise the Court.....	349
VIII. Provisional Arrest (Article 92)	349
A. The Necessity of Provisional Arrest	350
B. The Content of the Request for Provisional Arrest.....	350
C. The Need of the Request for Surrender	350
D. The Request for Surrender Delivered at a Later Date	351
IX. Other Forms of Cooperation (Article 93)	351
A. General Remarks.....	352
B. The Title.....	353
C. The Forms of Cooperation	353
D. Protection of a Witness or an Expert.....	354
E. “Existing fundamental legal principle of general application”.....	355
F. Grounds for Refusal of Other Forms of Assistance.....	355
G. National Security	357
H. Conditional or Alternative Assistance.....	357
I. The Notice of the Reason of Denial	358
J. The Temporary Transfer of a Person in Custody	358
K. Confidentiality of Documents and Information.....	358
L. Competing Requests Other Than for Surrender or Extradition.....	359
M. Assistance by the Court.....	360
X. Postponement of Execution of a Request in Respect of Ongoing Investigation or Prosecution (Article 94)	361
XI. Postponement of Execution of a Request in Respect of an Admissibility Challenge (Article 95)	361
XII. Contents of Request for Other Forms of Assistance under Article 93 (Article 96)	362
XIII. Consultations (Article 97)	364

XIV. Cooperation with Respect to Waiver of Immunity and Consent to Surrender	
(Article 98)	364
A. Article 98 of the Statute.....	365
B. The Article 98 Agreement Proposed by the United States	366
XV. Execution of Requests under Articles 93 and 96 (Article 99)	368
A. The Relevant Procedure under the Law of the Requested State	368
B. An Urgent Request	369
C. The Language and Form of Replies.....	369
D. The Execution of a Non-Compulsory Measure.....	369
E. Confidential Information Connected with National Security	370
XVI. Costs (Article 100)	371
XVII. Rule of Speciality (Article 101)	371
XVIII. Use of Terms (Article 102)	373
Chapter 12 Enforcement	375
I. Introduction	375
II. Role of States in Enforcement of Sentences of Imprisonment (Article 103)	375
A. The Designation of the State of Enforcement.....	376
B. The Notification by the State of Enforcement	377
C. The Principle of Shared Responsibility	378
D. The Residual Rule of Enforcement of Imprisonment.....	378
E. General Obligation Regarding Recognition [and Enforcement] of Judgements.....	378
III. Change in Designation of State of Enforcement (Article 104)	379
IV. Enforcement of the Sentence (Article 105)	380
V. Supervision of Enforcement of Sentences and Conditions of Imprisonment (Article 106)	380
VI. Transfer of the Person upon Completion of Sentence (Article 107)	381
VII. Limitation on the Prosecution or Punishment of Other Offences (Article 108)	382
VIII. Enforcement of Fines and Forfeiture Measures (Article 109)	383
IX. Review by the Court Concerning Reduction of Sentence (Article 110)	384
X. Escape (Article 111)	385
Chapter 13 Assembly of States Parties and Financing	387
I. Assembly of States Parties (Article 112)	387
A. The Composition of the Assembly of States Parties.....	388
B. The Function of the Assembly of States Parties	388
C. Bureau of the Assembly	389
D. Subsidiary Bodies.....	390
E. The Participation of the President of the Court, the Prosecutor and the Registrar.....	390
F. The Meeting of the Assembly	390
G. The Vote of the Assembly.....	391
H. Other Provisions	391
II. Financing of the Court and Financial Regulations (Article 113)	391
III. Payment of Expenses (Article 114)	392
IV. Funds of the Court and of the Assembly of States Parties (Article 115)	393
V. Voluntary Contributions (Article 116)	394
VI. Assessment of Contributions (Article 117)	394
VII. Annual Audit (Article 118)	395

Chapter 14 Final Clauses	397
I. Settlement of Disputes (Article 119)	397
II. Reservations (Article 120)	398
III. Amendments (Article 121)	399
A. The Seven-Year Waiting Period	400
B. Voting to Decide to Take Up the Amendment Proposal	401
C. Voting to Adopt an Amendment	401
D. The Requirement for an Amendment to Enter into Force	401
E. The Requirement for an Amendment to Articles 5–8 of the Statute to Enter into Force	402
F. Withdrawal from the Statute Because of an Amendment	402
G. Circulation of the Amendment	403
IV. Amendments to Provisions of an Institutional Nature (Article 122)	403
V. Review of the Statute (Article 123)	404
VI. Transitional Provision (Article 124)	405
VII. Signature, Ratification, Acceptance, Approval or Accession (Article 125)	405
VIII. Entry into Force (Article 126)	406
IX. Withdrawal (Article 127)	406
X. Authentic Texts (Article 128)	407
Chapter 15 Conclusion	409
Annex: Elements of Crime	413
Annex: Rules of Procedure and Evidence	447
Index	519