

A Higher Law

*Readings on the Influence of
Christian Thought in
Anglo-American Law*

Third Edition

BY JEFFREY A. BRAUCH
REGENT UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

WILLIAM S. HEIN & CO., INC.
GETZVILLE, NEW YORK
2019

Publishers' Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Brauch, Jeffrey A., author. | Budziszewski, J., 1952- writer of introduction.

Title: A higher law : readings on the influence of Christian thought in Anglo-American law / by Jeffrey A. Brauch.

Description: Third edition. | Getzville, New York : William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 2019. | Revision of the 2008 2nd edition. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: ISBN: 978-0-8377-4106-2 | LCCN: 2019940636

Subjects: LCSH: Common law--United States--Philosophy. | Religion and law--United States. | Common law--Great Britain--Philosophy. | Religion and law--Great Britain. | Christian philosophy. | Ethical relativism. | Cultural relativism. | Contemporary, The--Religious aspects.

Classification: LCC: KF380 .B62 2019 | DDC: 340.5/7--dc23

© 2019 William S. Hein & Co., Inc.
All rights reserved.

Printed in the United States of America



This volume is printed on acid-free paper
By William S. Hein & Co., Inc.

Dedication

To Becky, my true love and best friend

Table of Contents

Preface to the First Edition	xi
Preface to the Second Edition	xiii
Preface to the Third Edition	xv
Acknowledgements	xvii
Introduction	xix
<i>J. Budziszewski, What We Can't Not Know</i>xxi	
Part A The Nature of Law and the Fundamental Shift in Legal Thinking ...	1
Chapter 1 Higher Law Thinking: Man's Law Is Based on and Evaluated by the Law of God	3
A. Thomas Aquinas on Natural Law	3
<i>Thomas Aquinas, Summa Theologica</i>	4
B. Higher Law Thinking Displayed by the Common Law's Leading Commentators	19
1. Henry de Bracton on Higher Law	19
<i>Henry de Bracton, De Legibus et Consuetudinibus Angliae (The Laws and Customs of England)</i>	20
2. Sir Edward Coke on Higher Law	22
<i>Calvin's Case</i>	23
3. William Blackstone on Higher Law	25
<i>William Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of England, Vol I</i>	26
C. The Practical Impact of Higher Law Thinking on Citizens, Lawmakers, and Judges	33
<i>Charles Rice, Some Reasons for a Restoration of Natural Law Jurisprudence</i>	35
<i>Martin Luther King, Jr., Letter from Birmingham Jail</i>	40

	<i>Michael Paulsen, Accusing Justice: Some Variations on the Themes of Robert M. Cover's 'Justice Accused'</i>	46
Chapter 2	The Influence of Higher Law Thinking on the Common Law	59
A.	What Is the Common Law?	59
	<i>William Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of England, Vol I</i>	60
	<i>Russell Kirk, The Roots of American Order</i>	62
B.	Common Law and Equity.....	64
	<i>Arthur Hogue, Origins of the Common Law</i>	65
	<i>Stephen Yeazell, Civil Procedure</i>	67
C.	Development of the Rule of Law and the Protection of Individual Liberty	71
	<i>Henry de Bracton, De Legibus et Consuetudinibus Angliae (The Laws and Customs of England)</i>	73
	<i>Magna Carta</i>	74
	<i>Russell Kirk, The Roots of American Order</i>	80
	<i>Abraham Kuyper, Calvinism and Politics</i>	85
	<i>Craig Stern, The Common Law and the Religious Foundations of the Rule of Law before Casey</i>	95
Chapter 3	The Shift from Higher Law Thinking to Legal Relativism	105
A.	Legal Positivism.....	105
	<i>John Austin, The Province of Jurisprudence Determined</i>	106
	<i>Hans Kelsen, The Pure Theory of Law Part I and II</i>	108
B.	Legal Realism	117
	<i>Oliver Wendell Holmes, Jr., The Common Law</i>	119
	<i>Oliver Wendell Holmes, Jr., The Path of the Law</i>	120
	<i>Karl Llewellyn, Some Realism about Realism</i>	126
	<i>Jerome Frank, Law and the Modern Mind</i>	131
C.	Legal Utilitarianism: Law and Economics.....	136
	<i>Richard Posner, Economic Analysis of Law</i>	137
	<i>Richard Posner, Common Law Economic Torts: An Economic and Legal Analysis</i>	142
	<i>Richard Posner, Economic Analysis of Law</i>	146

<i>Table of Contents</i>	vii
D. Legal Deconstructionism.....	150
1. Critical Legal Studies	150
<i>Mark Kelman, Trashing</i>	150
2. Critical Race Theory	161
<i>Athena D. Mutua, The Rise, Development and Future</i> <i>Directions of Critical Race Theory and Related</i> <i>Scholarship</i>	162
<i>Cynthia Lee, (E)racing Trayvon Martin</i>	164
3. Feminist Jurisprudence	173
<i>Dana Raigrodski, Reasonableness and Objectivity:</i> <i>A Feminist Discourse of the Fourth Amendment</i>	173
Part B The Clash over Legal Thinking in Contemporary Legal Issues.....	183
Chapter 4 Criminal Law	185
A. Goals of the Criminal Justice System.....	185
1. Retribution.....	185
<i>Jeremy Bentham, An Introduction to the Principles of</i> <i>Morals and Legislation</i>	187
<i>William Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of</i> <i>England, Vol IV</i>	189
<i>Judge Richard Nygaard, The Myth of Punishment:</i> <i>Is American Penology Ready for the 21st Century?</i>	190
<i>Jeffrey C. Tuomala, The Value of Punishment: A</i> <i>Response to Judge Richard L. Nygaard</i>	194
<i>C.S. Lewis, God in the Dock</i>	200
2. Restorative Justice	208
<i>Charles Colson and Pat Nolan, Prescription for Safer</i> <i>Communities</i>	210
<i>Mary Ellen Reimund, The Law and Restorative Justice:</i> <i>Friend or Foe? A Systemic Look at the Legal Issues in</i> <i>Restorative Justice</i>	213
<i>Megan Stephens, Lessons from the Front Lines of</i> <i>Canada's Restorative Justice Experiment</i>	222
<i>Stephen P. Garvey, Punishment as Atonement</i>	230
B. Human Responsibility and Criminal Guilt.....	235
1. The Common Law View.....	235
<i>William Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of</i> <i>England, Vol IV</i>	235

	<i>The Queen v. Dudley & Stephens</i>	243
2.	Current Issues: Environmental Influence as an Excuse	251
	<i>Thomas A. Hafemeister and Nicole A. Stockey, Last Stand? The Criminal Responsibility of War Veterans Returning from Iraq and Afghaistan with Posttraumatic Stress Disorder</i>	252
	<i>Patricia Falk, Novel Theories of Criminal Defense Based upon the Toxicity of the Social Environment: Urban Psychosis, Television Intoxication and Black Rage</i>	265
	<i>Phillip E. Johnson, Human Nature and Criminal Responsibility: The Biblical View Restored</i>	266
Chapter 5	Civil and Criminal Procedure: Jury Trial	277
A.	Blackstone and the Jury at Common Law.....	277
	<i>William Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of England, Vol III</i>	277
	<i>William Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of England, Vol IV</i>	279
B.	The Jury Trial Today	285
	<i>Jerome Frank, Courts on Trial</i>	286
	<i>G.K. Chesterton, The Twelve Men</i>	296
	<i>National Center for State Courts, Center for Jury Studies, The State-of-the-States Survey of Jury Improvement Efforts, Executive Summary</i>	299
	<i>Benjamin Madison, Trial by Jury or by Military Tribunal for Accused Terrorist Detainees Facing the Death Penalty? An Examination of Principles That Transcend the U.S. Constitution</i>	302
Chapter 6	Constitutional Rights	309
	<i>Planned Parenthood v. Casey</i>	310
	<i>Michael Paulsen, Accusing Justice: Some Variations on the Themes of Robert M. Cover's 'Justice Accused'</i>	320
	<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	323
	<i>Obergefell v. Hodges</i>	331
Chapter 7	Human Rights	343
	<i>Goodwin v. United Kingdom</i>	345
	<i>Hamalainen v. Finland</i>	353
	<i>Jeffrey A. Brauch, The Human Rights Movement and the Prevention of Evil: The Need to Look Inward as Well as Out</i>	359

<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>ix</i>
Chapter 8 Biotechnology	367
<i>Antonio Regalado, Engineering the Perfect Baby</i>	369
<i>Paul Enriquez, Genome Editing and the Jurisprudence of Scientific Empiricism</i>	375
<i>Peter Singer, Speciesism and Moral Status</i>	382
<i>Robert George, Embryo Ethics: Justice and Nascent Human Life</i>	388
<i>Jeffrey A. Brauch, Flawed Perfection</i>	389
Part C Current Thinking on How Higher Law Should Affect Human Law	399
Chapter 9 What Is the Role of Old Testament Law Today?	401
<i>Westminster Confession of Faith</i>	404
<i>Tremper Longman, God’s Law and Mosaic Punishments Today in Theonomy: A Reformed Critique</i>	405
<i>Vern S. Poythress, The Shadow of Christ in the Law of Moses</i>	415
<i>Pope John Paul II, Veritatis Splendor</i>	427
Chapter 10 To What Extent Should Higher Law Be Applied to Modern Society?	435
A. Encouragements Toward the Use of Higher Law	435
<i>Michael P. Schutt, Redeeming Law</i>	436
<i>Charles Colson, Kingdoms in Conflict</i>	440
<i>Clarence Thomas, The Higher Law Background of the Privileges or Immunities Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment</i>	451
B. Cautions Regarding the Use of Higher Law	456
<i>Joel Belz, Going to God’s Law School</i>	457
<i>Joel Belz, A Minimal Civil Code</i>	459
<i>John Warwick Montgomery, The Law Above the Law</i>	462
<i>David Skeel and William Stuntz, Christianity and the (Modest) Rule of Law</i>	465
Index	475