

Dignity Law: Global Recognition, Cases, and Perspectives

Erin Daly

*Professor of Law
Widener University Delaware Law School
edaly@widener.edu*

James R. May

*Distinguished Professor of Law
Widener University Delaware Law School
jrmay@widener.edu*

William S. Hein & Co., Inc.
Getzville, New York
2020

Publishers' Cataloging in Publication

Names: Daly, Erin, author. | May, James R., author.

Title: Dignity law : global recognition, cases, and perspectives / Erin Daly, James R. May.

Description: Getzville, New York : William S. Hein & Co. Inc., 2020. | Includes index.

Identifiers: ISBN: 978-0-8377-4135-2 | LCCN: 2020944129

Subjects: LCSH: Respect for persons--Law and legislation. | Equality before the law. | Human rights. | Civil rights. | Social rights. | Liberty. | Political rights.

Classification: LCC: K3249 .D35 2020 | DDC: 342.08/5--dc23

Dedicated to those striving to make the promise of dignity a reality.

— ED & JM

Cover photograph reproduced by permission of
David Goldman Photography (www.davidgoldmanphoto.com).

© 2020 William S. Hein & Co., Inc.
All rights reserved.

Printed in the United States of America



This volume is printed on acid-free paper by
William S. Hein & Co., Inc.

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

PREFACE

SELECTED CONSTITUTIONAL TEXTS

OVERVIEW: MAPPING DIGNITY LAW

UNIT ONE: INTRODUCTION TO DIGNITY LAW

Chapter 1: Definitions of Dignity

Chapter 2: Dignity in History, Theory, Philosophy, and Religion

Chapter 3: Dignity in the Human Rights Era

UNIT TWO: DIGNITY AND IDENTITY

Chapter 4: The Worth of the Human Person

Chapter 5: Identity and Personal Freedoms

Chapter 6: Agency over One's Life

Chapter 7: Gender and Sexual Identity

Chapter 8: Dignity and Equality

UNIT THREE: LIVING WITH DIGNITY

Chapter 9: Introduction to Social, Economic, and Cultural Rights

Chapter 10: *La Vida Digna*/Living with Dignity

UNIT FOUR: DIGNITY AND VULNERABILITY

Chapter 11: Protection against Humiliation

Chapter 12: In the Criminal Justice System

UNIT FIVE: PARTICIPATORY DIGNITY

Chapter 13: The Dignity-Based Right to Participate in Political Activity

Chapter 14: Incidents of Citizenship Beyond Electoral Politics

CONCLUSION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	<i>xi</i>
Selected Constitutional Texts (2020)	<i>xv</i>
Overview: Mapping Dignity Law	<i>xxi</i>
Features of Dignity Law	xxiv
A Note about Case Selection.....	xxix
The Broad Outlines of Dignity Law.....	xxx
UNIT ONE: INTRODUCTION TO DIGNITY LAW	1
Chapter 1: Definitions of Dignity	3
A. Dignity for Some	3
Adapted from James R. May & Erin Daly, <i>Advanced Introduction to Human Dignity and Law</i>	3
B. Dignity for All.....	4
C. Dignity under Law	5
D. The Meaning and Qualities of Human Dignity	7
Chapter 2: Dignity in History, Theory, Philosophy, and Religion	11
A. Dignity in Western Thought.....	11
Oscar Schachter, <i>Human Dignity as a Normative Concept</i>	14
B. Dignity and “Asian Values”	15
Jimmy Chia-Shin Hsu, Introduction, in <i>Human Dignity in Asia: Dialogue Between Law and Culture</i>	16
C. Dignity and Ubuntu.....	17
James R. May & Erin Daly, <i>Advanced Introduction to Human Dignity and Law</i>	17
D. Dignity and Islam.....	18
E. A Universal Value	20
Chapter 3: Dignity in the Human Rights Era	23
Stage 1: The United Nations Charter.....	23
Note on the American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man	24
Stage 2: The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	24
Note on the Text of the UDHR	27
Stage 3: International Human Rights Law.....	29
Stage 4: Dignity as a Value and Right in National Constitutions.....	32
Stage 5: Dignity in Professionalism	33
Michelle Freeman, <i>The Right to Dignity in the United States</i>	36

UNIT TWO: DIGNITY AND IDENTITY	47
Chapter 4: The Worth of the Human Person	49
Harvard College v. Canada (Commissioner of Patents) (Canada 2004)	50
Michael Sachs & Ariel L. Bendor, <i>Human Dignity as a Constitutional Concept in Germany and Israel</i>	55
Air Transport Security Act Case (Germany 2006).....	58
Chapter 5: Identity and Personal Freedoms	67
Adapted from Erin Daly, <i>Dignity Rights: Courts, Constitutions, and the Worth of the Human Person</i>	67
A. Freedom of Movement.....	69
Gwanda v. Malawi (2015)	69
Maneka Gandhi v. Union of India (1978)	76
Kituo Cha Sheria v. Attorney General (Kenya 2013)	80
Note on Individualized Treatment: To Be Treated “As a Person”	82
B. Freedom of Action	84
U. no: 261/2008-0-0 (Right to Smoke) (Macedonia 2009).....	85
C. Freedom of Conscience.....	87
Sent. 334/96 (Oath Case) (Italy 1996).....	87
D. Right to Work	88
Benedita Mac Crorie, <i>The Definition of Human Dignity in Plural Societies</i>	89
Note on Consenting to Indignities: Does Dignity Limit Consent or Does Consent Limit Dignity?	92
Bangladesh Society for the Enforcement of Human Rights v. Government of Bangladesh (2000).....	93
Liaqat Ali Chughtai v. Federation of Pakistan (2012)	97
E. Right to Control Personal Information	99
Puttaswamy v. India (2018)	100
Interpretation No. 603 (Fingerprint Case) (Taiwan 2005)	115
Case U-I-25/95 (Listening Devices) (Slovenia 1997).....	121
1 BvR 966/09, 1 BvR 1140/09 (Covert Surveillance Case) (Germany 2016).....	125
Note on Dignity in Tort Law.....	126
Kenneth S. Abraham & G. Edward White, <i>The Puzzle of the Dignitary Torts</i>	127
Chapter 6: Agency over One’s Life	129
A. Forced Sterilization.....	130
B. Contraceptives and Abortion.....	131
Decision of February 21, 2017 regarding abortion (Croatia 2017).....	134
C. Marriage.....	139
D. Family.....	139
Adalah Legal Centre for Arab Minority Rights in Israel v. Minister of Interior (2006).....	140
1 BvR 421/05 (Secret Paternity Test) (Germany 2007).....	148
E. Right to Die	150
Lozada Tirado v. Tirado Flecha (Puerto Rico, U.S. 2010)	150
The European Court of Human Rights	152
The European Convention on Human Rights.....	153
Pretty v. the United Kingdom (ECtHR 2002)	155

Table of Contents

vii

Note on Dignity after Death	160
Chapter 7: Gender and Sexual Identity	163
A. Same-Sex Relations	163
Navtej Singh Johar & Others v. Union of India (2018)	163
B. Same-Sex Marriage	168
Minister of Home Affairs v. Fourie (South Africa 2005)	168
Acción de Inconstitucionalidad 2/2010 (Same-sex Marriage and Adoption Case) (Mexico 2010).....	171
Obergefell v. Hodges (United States 2015).....	174
C. Gender Identity	181
Sunil Babu Pant and Others v. Nepal Government (2007)	181
Chapter 8: Dignity and Equality	191
A. The Architecture of Dignity and Equality Jurisprudence	191
R. v. Kapp (Canada 2008).....	194
B. Discrimination on the Basis of Gender	199
Katiba Institute v. Independent Electoral & Boundaries Commission (Kenya 2017).....	199
Mifume v. Attorney General (Uganda 2015)	205
C. Religious Discrimination.....	210
Ameen Masih v. Federation of Pakistan (2017).....	211
D. Discrimination on the Basis of Disability	217
Hafiz Junaid Mahmood v. Government of Punjab (Pakistan 2016)	218
Barrister Asfandyar Khan v. Government of Punjab (Pakistan 2018).....	223
Center for Health, Human Rights and Development v. Attorney General (Uganda 2011).....	226
UNIT THREE: LIVING WITH DIGNITY.....	231
Chapter 9: Introduction to Social, Economic, and Cultural Rights	233
The International Human Rights System, UN Chronicle.....	234
Progressive Realization, UN Office of the High Commission on Human Rights.....	238
Chapter 10: La Vida Digna / Living with Dignity	241
A. The Basics.....	241
Francis Coralie Mullin v. Administrator, Union Territory of India (1981).....	241
B. Shelter	243
South Africa v. Grootboom and Others (2000)	243
Satrose Ayuma & 11 Others v. Registered Trustees of the Kenya Railways Staff Retirement Benefits Scheme & 3 Others (2013).....	248
C. Health.....	251
Soobramoney v. Minister of Health (Kwazulu-Natal) (South Africa 1997)	252
Sentencia T-608/11 (Therapeutic Parrot case) (Colombia 2011)	254
D. Education	256
Mohini Jain v. State of Karnataka and Ors (India 1992).....	257
E. Economic Security	261
1. A Living Wage	261
Sentencia T-291/09 (Recyclers Case) (Colombia 2009).....	261
2. Pension.....	266
5/2009 of 9 February 2010 (Hartz IV) (Germany 2010).....	266

F. Migration with Dignity	270
Benefits for Asylum Seekers (Germany 2012)	270
G. Healthy Environment	277
Gbemre v. Shell Petroleum Dev. Co. Nigeria Ltd. and Others (2005).....	282
Ashgar Leghari v. Federation of Pakistan (2018).....	286
Pro Public v. Godavari Marble Industries Pvt. Ltd. and Others (Nepal 2015).....	292
Friends of the Irish Environment v. Government of Ireland (2020).....	306
Erin Daly & James R. May, <i>Exploring Environmental Justice Through the Lens of Human Dignity</i>	309
H. Culture	310
1. Holistic Rights of Indigenous Communities.....	310
Center for Social Justice Studies et al. v. Presidency of the Republic et al., Judgment T-622/16 (Rio Atrato Case) (Colombia 2016).....	310
2. Land Rights	332
Mosetlhanyane v. Attorney General (Botswana 2010).....	333
3. Language Rights.....	338
UNIT FOUR: DIGNITY AND VULNERABILITY.....	339
Chapter 11: Protection against Humiliation	341
A. People in the Care of the State.....	342
JM v. Bohnice Psychiatric Hospital (Czech Republic 2013).....	342
B. Children	345
Villagran-Morales et al. v. Guatemala (Case of the “Street Children”) (IACtHR 1999).....	345
C. Survivors of Rape.....	347
Meaoa v. The State (Papua New Guinea 1996)	347
Yekat v. The State (Papua New Guinea 2000).....	348
People of the Philippines v. Quirino Quijada y Circulado (1999).....	349
Kunene and Rex (Eswatini 2017)	350
D. Survivors of Hate Crimes	352
Karaahmed v. Bulgaria (2015).....	352
E. Survivors of Human Rights Abuses	354
Sayeede v. Government of Bangladesh (International Crimes Tribunal) (2014).....	354
Sudan Human Rights Organisation, Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions v. The Sudan (ACHPR 2009)	358
Case OO2/02 (Cambodia 2007).....	362
Chapter 12: In the Criminal Justice System.....	365
A. Policing.....	366
Bouyid v. Belgium (ECtHR 2015)	367
Swaziland v. Ngomane (Eswatini 2013)	376
Florence Amunga Omukanda & Another v. Attorney General (Kenya 2016).....	380
B. Prosecution.....	381
Indiana v. Edwards (United States 2008)	382
C. Detention.....	386
Francis Coralie Mullin v. Administrator, Union Territory of India (1981).....	386
D. Incarceration	390
Masangano v. Minister of Home Affairs and Internal Security & Commissioner of Prisons (Malawi 2009).....	390

Table of Contents	ix
Walker v. State (Montana, U.S. 2003).....	397
E. Sentencing.....	405
1. Disproportion.....	405
Daniel v. Namibia (2011).....	405
Petrus and Another v. Botswana (1984).....	407
2. Life Imprisonment.....	409
Life Imprisonment Case (Germany 1977).....	409
3. Capital Punishment.....	415
Gregg v. Georgia (United States 1976).....	415
Sayedee v. Government of Bangladesh (International Crimes Tribunal) (2014).....	421
Makwanyane and Mchunu v. South Africa (1995).....	430
UNIT FIVE: PARTICIPATORY DIGNITY	459
Chapter 13: The Dignity-Based Right to Participate in Political Activity	461
A. Participatory Dignity.....	461
Adapted from Erin Daly, <i>Dignity Rights: Courts, Constitutions, and the Worth of the Human Person</i>	462
B. The Right to Vote.....	466
Arshad Mehmood v. The Commissioner of Elections in Pakistan (2013)	467
C. Political Engagement.....	473
Association for the Struggle of Transvestite-Transsexual Identity v. Inspector General of Justice (Argentina 2006).....	473
Bundesrat v. National Democratic Party of Germany (2017).....	478
Doctors for Life International v. The Speaker of the National Assembly (South Africa 2006).....	481
Chapter 14: Incidents of Citizenship Beyond Electoral Politics	491
A. Public Employment.....	491
District Court in Częstochowa from 2016-03-18 (Poland 2016).....	492
B. Military Service.....	497
Movement for Quality Government in Israel v. The Knesset (2006).....	497
Conclusion.....	505
Index.....	511
Table of Cases.....	517